

CONTENTS

1	SUMMARY	1-1
	BIOFUELS VERSUS PETROFUELS: FOUR FINDINGS	1-2
	LIMITS TO THE STUDY.....	1-6
	Case-Specific Limitations	1-6
	General Limitations.....	1-8
	WHAT IS CORRECT? IMPLICATIONS FOR GOVERNMENT AND COMPANY POLICIES	1-8
	Land-Use Policy Must Become Part of Energy Policy and Global Warming Policy... ..	1-5
	Carbon Farming Needs and Economic Boost.....	1-9
	Incremental Footprints and Land-Use Footprints Should Be Part of the Method for Comparing Biofuels and Petrofuels.....	1-9
	Petrochemical Companies Can Help Convert Waste to Energy.....	1-9
2	INTRODUCTION	2-1
3	WHY ANOTHER COMPARISON, AND WHAT ARE ITS KEY REFERENCES?.....	3-1
4	METHOD OF THE ANALYSIS/COMPARISON.....	4-1
	LIFE CYCLE ASSESSMENT, AND HOW IT WAS APPLIED HERE	4-1
	Goal	4-2
	Scope of the Study	4-2
	Normalization of the Comparison (Functional Unit and Reference Flows)	4-2
	By Function.....	4-2
	By Land Use	4-4
	System Boundaries and Cut-off Rules	4-4
	Allocation of Emissions.....	4-4
	Amortization of Emissions	4-5
	Characterization	4-5
	Data Sources and Calculation.....	4-8
	LIMITATIONS OF THE APPROACH	4-9

CONTENTS (Continued)

5	AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTION: SYSTEM DESCRIPTIONS	5-1
	CONTENTIOUS GHG ISSUES IN AGRICULTURE	5-2
	What are Wastes?	5-2
	Alternative Land Use	5-2
	CO ₂ Intake, Sequestration	5-3
	Capital Goods in Agriculture.....	5-3
	Nitrous Oxide Emissions	5-4
	DEFINITIONS OF AGRICULTURAL SYSTEMS.....	5-5
	Biodiesel Crops	5-5
	Rapeseed Cultivations and Harvest	5-5
	Defining the Farm: Primary Land Use, Avoided Products, Organic vs Conventional, Capital Goods.....	5-8
	Rapeseed Yield	5-9
	Carbon Content of Rapeseed, and CO ₂ Uptake	5-9
	N Fertilizer and N ₂ O Emissions.....	5-9
	Methane Emissions	5-11
	Soybean Cultivation and Harvest	5-11
	Defining the Farm: Crop Rotation, Primary Land Use, Avoided Products, Organic vs. Conventional, Capital Goods.....	5-13
	Soybean Yield	5-13
	Carbon Content of Soybean, and CO ₂ Uptake.....	5-13
	Fertilizers, N ₂ O Emission, Agrochemicals, Electricity	5-14
	Palm Oil Fruit Cultivation and Harvest	5-14
	Defining the Farm: Primary Land Use, Capital Goods	5-15
	Palm Oil Fruit Yield	5-17
	Carbon Content of Palm Oil Fruit, and CO ₂ Uptake	5-17
	Fertilizers, Agrochemicals, Energy and N ₂ O	5-17
	Jatropha.....	5-17
	Tallow Production	5-17
	Allocation of Inputs/Outputs for Tallow	5-18

CONTENTS (Continued)

Is Tallow a Product or a Waste?	5-19
Yellow Grease Production	5-20
Biodiesel Crops	5-21
Corn (Maize)	5-21
Defining the Farm: Crop Rotation, Primary Land Use, Avoid Products, Organic vs. Conventional, Capital Goods.....	5-23
Corn Yield	5-24
Carbon Content of Corn, and CO ₂ Uptake	5-25
Fertilizer, N ₂ O Emissions, Agrochemicals, Electricity.....	5-25
Grain Drying.....	5-25
Corn (Maize) Stover	5-25
Sugar Cane	5-26
Defining the Farm: Primary Land Use, Capital Goods	5-27
Sugarcane Yield	5-28
Carbon Content of Sugarcane, and CO ₂ Uptake.....	5-28
Fertilizers, Agrochemicals, Energy, N ₂ O and Methane	5-28
ALTERNATIVE LAND-USE EMISSION FACTORS AND AMORTIZATION.....	5-28
Alternative Land-Use Emission Factors	5-28
Alternative of Land-Use Change Factors	5-31
6 BIOFUELS PROCESSING AND TRANSPORT: SYSTEM DESCRIPTIONS.....	6-1
PROCESS FROM CROPS TO BIODIESEL	6-2
Rapeseed to Rape Oil to Biodiesel	6-2
Allocation Between Rapeseed Oil and Rape Meal	6-4
Allocation Between Biodiesel and Glycerin	6-4
Soybeans to Soybean Oil to Biodiesel	6-5
Allocation Between Soy Oil and Soy Meal	6-7
Allocation Between Biodiesel and Glycerin	6-7
Palm Fruit Bunches to Palm Oil to Biodiesel.....	6-7
Allocation Between Crude Palm Oil and Palm Kernels.....	6-9
Emissions from Treatment of Palm Oil Mill Effluent (POME)	6-9

CONTENTS (Continued)

Allocation Between Biodiesel and Glycerin.....	6-10
Tallow to Biodiesel.....	6-10
Yellow Grease to Biodiesel.....	6-11
Hydrotreater Process, Oil to Biodiesel	6-13
PROCESS CROPS TO BIOETHANOL.....	6-13
Corn/Maize to Bioethanol	6-14
Allocation Between Ethanol and DDGS	6-14
Carbon Dioxide Emissions: Recovery and 'Carbon Neutrality'	6-15
Corn Stover to Bioethanol	6-15
Sugar Cane to Bioethanol	6-16
Allocation Between Bioethanol and Co-Products.....	6-16
Carbon Dioxide Emissions: Recovery and 'Carbon Neutrality'	6-17
Emissions from Mill Effluent (Vinasse).....	6-17
TRANSPORT OF BIOFUELS TO MARKET	6-17
7 PETROFUELS PRODUCTION AND PROCESSING	7-1
PETRODIESEL AND GASOLINE	7-1
NATURAL GAS TO FISCHER-TROPSCH (FT) DIESEL.....	7-6
Production of Natural Gas	7-6
FT Conversion of Natural Gas to Diesel.....	7-8
FT Diesel Transport to Market.....	7-8
8 FUELS USE: SYSTEM DESCRIPTION.....	8-1
CARBON NEUTRALITY OF BIOFUELS, AND METHANOL CONTENT IN METHYL ESTER BIODIESELS	8-3
MIXED-FUEL EFFICIENCIES	8-4
WHAT ABOUT PARTICLE EMISSIONS?.....	8-4
9 CARBON FOOTPRINTS (GHG INVENTORIES) FOR EACH FUEL.....	9-1
DIESEL CARBON FOOTPRINTS	9-5

CONTENTS (Continued)

Rape Oil Biodiesel (RME).....	9-5
Soy Oil Biodiesel (SME)	9-8
Palm Oil Biodiesel (PME)	9-11
Tallow Biodiesel (TME).....	9-14
Yellow Grease Biodiesel (YGME)	9-17
Hydrobiodiesel (HBD).....	9-20
Petrodiesel.....	9-23
Fischer-Tropsch (FT) Diesel.....	9-26
ETHANOL AND GASOLINE CARBON FOOTPRINTS.....	9-29
Corn/Maize Bioethonal	9-29
CO ₂ Debit, and Credit, at Ethanol Plant	9-32
Allocation to Ethanol and DDGS	9-32
Land Use Conversion from Prairie to Cropland	9-32
Inclusion of Capital Goods	9-32
Fuel Economy.....	9-32
Stover Bioethanol	9-33
Sugar Cane Bioethanol	9-36
CO ₂ Debit, and Credit, at Ethanol Plant	9-39
Allocation to Ethanol and Co-products	9-39
Land Use Conversion from Tropical Forest to Cropland.....	9-39
Inclusion of Capital Goods	9-39
Fuel Economy.....	9-39
Gasoline.....	9-40
HOW DOES THIS STUDY COMPARE TO OUR PREVIOUS STUDY?.....	9-43
10 INCREMENTAL FOORPRINTS AND IMPLICATIONS FOR FUEL CHOICES	10-1
WHAT ARE 'CARBON FOOTPRINTS ADJUSTED FOR INCREMENTAL SEQUESTRATION', AND WHY ARE THEY IMPORTANT?.....	10-2
INCREMENTAL FOOTPRINTS' IMPLICATIONS FOR FUEL CHOICES.....	10-3

CONTENTS (Concluded)

11	DIESEL VS. GASOLINE, BIOFUELS' YIELDS AND FOOTPRINTS BY PHASE....	11-1
	WHAT ABOUT DIESEL VERSUS GASOLINE?	11-1
	YIELD COMPARISON OF BIOFUELS.....	11-1
	BASE CASE FOOTPRINT COMPARISON, BY PHASE.....	11-3
12	LAND-USE FOOTPRINTS, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR LAND-USE CHOICES.....	12-1
	DEFINITION OF LAND-USE FOOTPRINT	12-1
	LAND-USE FOOTPRINTS' IMPLICATIONS FOR LAND USES AND FUEL CHOICES	12-1
13	'CARBON FARMING' IS UNATTRACTIVE AT TODAY'S CARBON PRICES	13-1
14	APPENDIX	14-1
	CONVERSIONS AND PHYSICAL CONSTANTS	14-1
	COMPARISONS OF INPUT DATA	14-2
	INCREMENTAL FOOTPRINTS: HOW THEY ARE CALCULATED	14-10
	LAND-USE FOOTPRINTS: HOW THEY ARE CALCULATED	14-15
	TRANSPORT AND UTILITIES: SYSTEM DESCRIPTIONS.....	14-17
15	REFERENCES	15-1

ILLUSTRATIONS

1.1	Allocated, Incremental Footprints of Choosing Petrodiesel Versus Base Case Biodiesel Footprints ^{DE}	1-3
1.2	Allocated, Incremental Footprints of Choosing Gasoline Versus Base Case Bioethanol Footprints ^{FG}	1-4
1.3	Base Case ^J Carbon Footprints, All Fuels in this Study	1-6
2.1	For Oil Buyers, the Mid-1980s and the 1990s Were Golden Years.....	2-1
4.1	Life-Cycle Inventory - A Conceptual View	4-1
5.1	Agricultural N ₂ O Emissions, Estimated By The IPCC Method	5-4
5.2	Global Prices (US\$/Tonne) For Tallow and Rapeseed, 1997 - 2004	5-20
5.3	US Corn to Fuel Has Soared (Corn to Ethanol, 1985-2005).....	5-24
9.1	Rape Methyl Ester (RME), Footprint Flow Chart, Base Case	9-6
9.2	Rape Methyl Ester (RME), Process - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case.....	9-7
9.3	Rape Methyl Ester (RME), GHG - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-7
9.4	Soy Methyl Ester (SME), Footprint Flow Chart, Base Case.....	9-9
9.5	Soy Methyl Ester (SME), Process - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-10
9.6	Soy Methyl Ester (SME), GHG - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-10
9.7	Palm Methyl Ester (PME), Footprint Flow Chart, Base Case	9-12
9.8	Palm Methyl Ester (PME), Process - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-13
9.9	Palm Methyl Ester (PME), GHG - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-13
9.10	Tallow Methyl Ester (TME), Footprint Flow Chart, Base Case	9-15
9.11	Tallow Methyl Ester (TME), Process - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-16
9.12	Tallow Methyl Ester (TME), GHG - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-16
9.13	Yellow Grease Methyl Ester (YGME), Footprint Flow Chart, Base Case	9-18
9.14	Yellow Grease Methyl Ester (YGME), Process - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-19
9.15	Yellow Grease Methyl Ester (YGME), GHG - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-19
9.16	Hydrobiodiesel (HBD), Footprint Flow Chart, Base Case	9-21
9.17	Hydrobiodiesel (HBD), Process - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case.....	9-22

ILLUSTRATIONS (Concluded)

9.18	Hydrobiodiesel (HBD), GHG - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case.....	9-22
9.19	Petrodiesel, Footprint Flow Chart, Base Case	9-24
9.20	Petrodiesel, Process - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case.....	9-25
9.21	Petrodiesel, GHG - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case.....	9-25
9.22	FT Diesel, Footprint Flow Chart, Base Case.....	9-27
9.23	FT Diesel, Process - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-28
9.24	FT Diesel, GHG - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-28
9.25	Corn/Maize Bioethanol, Footprint Flow Chart, Base Case	9-30
9.26	Corn/Maize Bioethanol, Process - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-31
9.27	Corn/Maize Bioethanol, GHG - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-31
9.28	Stover Bioethanol, Footprint Flow Chart, Base Case.....	9-34
9.29	Stover Bioethanol, Process - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-35
9.30	Stover Bioethanol, GHG - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-35
9.31	Sugar Cane Bioethanol, Footprint Flow Chart, Base Case.....	9-37
9.32	Sugar Cane Bioethanol, Process - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-38
9.33	Sugar Cane Bioethanol, GHG - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-38
9.34	Gasoline, Footprint Flow Chart, Base Case.....	9-41
9.35	Gasoline, Process - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case.....	9-42
9.36	Gasoline, GHG - Contribution Breakdown, Base Case	9-42
10.1	Base Case Carbon Footprints	10-2
10.2	Allocated, Incremental Footprints of Choosing Petrodiesel Versus Base Case Biodiesel Footprints	10-4
10.3	Allocated, Incremental Footprints of Choosing Gasoline Versus Base Case Bioethanol Footprints.....	10-5
11.1	Base Case Footprint, All Fuels, By Phase (KG CO ₂ E/100 KM Driven)	11-4
11.2	Base Case Footprint, All Fuels, By Phase (%).....	11-4
12.1	Land-Use Footprint, For Biodiesels Compared to Petrodiesel.....	12-2
12.2	Land-Use Footprint, For Bioethanols Compared to Gasoline	12-3

TABLES

1.1	Choices for Lower Carbon Footprint: Petro- Vs Bio-Fuels	1-2
1.2	Carbon Footprints, All Fuels Studied: Base Case Plus Sensitivity Maxima and Minima	1-7
2.1	Fuels Compared in This Study	2-2
2.2	Here Come the Commercial FT-Diesel Projects	2-3
3.1	Important References Used in This Study	3-2
4.1	Energy/Fuel Consumption and GHG Emissions from Combustion ^o , for 2010 Vehicles	4-3
4.2	Global Warming Potentials Used in This Study	4-6
4.3	Current Standards for Biodiesel	4-9
5.1	Production, Processing and Use Stages for the Biofuels Being Compared	5-1
5.2	GHG Inventories for the Agricultural Raw Materials	5-5
5.3	Rapeseed Cultivation and Harvest, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study.....	5-6
5.4	Eu Rapeseed Production, 2006	5-8
5.5	N-Fertilization of Rapeseed in Western Europe.....	5-10
5.6	N-Fertilizer to N ₂ O Emissions Ratios, For Rapeseed Cultivation	5-10
5.7	Soybean Cultivation and harvest, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study.....	5-11
5.8	Inputs/Outputs for Cultivation and Harvest of Palm Oil Fruit.....	5-15
5.9	Palm Oil Production, By Country, 2006.....	5-16
5.10	Palm-Based Biodiesel Production, 2006 and 2010.....	5-16
5.11	Inputs/Outputs for production of Tallow.....	5-18
5.12	Allocation of Inputs/Outputs for Slaughter/Rendering Products, Including Tallow	5-19
5.13	Inputs/Outputs for Production of Yellow Grease	5-20
5.14	Inputs/Outputs for Cultivation and Harvest of Corn/Maize	5-21
5.15	Inputs/Outputs for Harvest of Corn/Maize Stover	5-26
5.16	Inputs/Outputs for Cultivation and Harvest of Sugar Cane	5-27
5.17	Land Uses, Primary and Alternative, for the Crops Considered in this Study	5-29
5.18	Carbon Stock for Relevant land-Use Types Examines in this Study	5-30

TABLES (Continued)

5.19	CO ₂ Emissions Caused by Land-Use Conversion ^{SS}	5-31
6.1	Production, Processing and Use Stages for the Biofuels being Compared.....	6-1
6.2	Process Steps Defined, By Crop Type.....	6-2
6.3	Rapeseed to Crude Rapeseed Oil, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study	6-3
6.4	Crude Rapeseed Oil to Refined Rapeseed Oil, Key Inputs/Outputs for the Study	6-3
6.5	Refined Rapeseed Oil to Biodiesel, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study ^{VV}	6-4
6.6	Soybeans to Crude Soy Oil, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study	6-5
6.7	Crude Soy Oil to Refined Soy Oil, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study	6-6
6.8	Refined Soy Oil to Biodiesel, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study ^{XX}	6-6
6.9	Fresh Fruit Bunches to Crude Palm Oil, Primary Inputs to this Study	6-8
6.10	Crude Palm Oil to Refined Palm Oil, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study	6-8
6.11	Refined Palm Oil to Biodiesel, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study.....	6-9
6.12	Tallow to Treated Tallow, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study	6-10
6.13	Treated Tallow to Biodiesel, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study	6-11
6.14	Yellow Grease to Refined Yellow Grease, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study	6-12
6.15	Treated Yellow Grease to Biodiesel, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study	6-12
6.16	Treated Oil Hydrobiodiesel, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study.....	6-13
6.17	Corn/Maize to Bioethanol and DDGS, Dry Mill Process, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study	6-14
6.18	Stover to Bioethanol, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study	6-15
6.19	Sugar Cane to Bioethanol, Sugar and Electricity Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study.....	6-16
6.20	Transport, Biofuels from Production to Market.....	6-17
7.1	Production-Use Stages for the Petrofuels being Compared	7-1
7.2	Petrodiesel Production and Processing, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study	7-2
7.3	Gasoline (Unleaded) Production and Processing, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study.....	7-4
7.4	Natural Gas Production, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study	7-6

7.5	Natural Gas Production, Alternative Case	7-7
-----	--	-----

TABLES (Continued)

7.6	Natural Gas Conversion to FT Diesel, Key Inputs/Outputs for this Study.....	7-8
8.1	Energy/Fuel Consumption and GHG Emissions from Combustion ^{ZZ}	8-1
8.2	Base-Case Combustion Factors in this Study ^{BBB CCC}	8-2
8.3	Physical and Automotive-Combustion Properties of Fuels	8-3
8.4	CO ₂ Emissions from Combustion of Methyl Ester Biodiesels, Due to Methanol Content	8-4
8.5	Particles - What are they?	8-5
9.1	Carbon Footprints, All Fuels Studied Base Case Plus Sensitivity Maxima and Minima	9-1
9.2	Sensitivity Cases to the Base Case Footprints	9-3
9.3	RME Carbon Footprint, Base Case	9-5
9.4	SME Carbon Footprint, Base Case	9-8
9.5	PME Carbon Footprint, Base Case	9-11
9.6	TME Carbon Footprint, Base Case	9-14
9.7	YGME Carbon Footprint, Base Case	9-17
9.8	HBD Carbon Footprint, Base Case	9-20
9.9	Hydrobiodiesel Vs. Transesterified Biodiesel Footprints, By Feedstock.....	9-23
9.10	Petrodiesel Carbon Footprint, Base Case.....	9-23
9.11	FT Diesel Carbon Footprint, Base Case	9-26
9.12	Corn/Maize Biodethanol Carbon Footprint, Base Case	9-29
9.13	Stover Biodethanol Carbon Footprint, Base Case	9-33
9.14	Sugar Cane Biodethanol Carbon Footprint, Base Case	9-36
9.15	Gasoline Carbon Footprint, Base Case	9-40
9.16	RME Footprint Comparison, This Study Vs. Last Study, Adjusted for Fuel Economy.....	9-43
10.1	Base Case Carbon Footprints, From Smallest to Largest	10-1
10.2	Comparison of Base Case and Incremental Footprints (Hypothetical Case)	10-3
10.3	Choices for Lower Carbon Footprints: Petro-Vs. Bio-Fuels	10-5

11.1	Yield Comparison of Biodiesels and Bioethanols.....	11-2
TABLES (Concluded)		
11.2	Base Case Footprints, All Fuels, By Phase (KG CO ₂ E/100 KM Driven).....	11-5
13.1	Income Statement for a Typical European Cereals Farm.....	13-2
14.1	Conversions and Physical Contents.....	14-1
14.2	Rapeseed Cultivation and Harvest inputs/Outputs, Comparison of Existing Studies.....	14-2
14.3	Soybean Cultivation and Harvest Inputs/Outputs, Comparison of Existing LCAS	14-3
14.4	Biodiesel Incremental Footprints, Relative to Petrodiesel.....	14-5
14.5	Bioethanol Incremental Footprints, Relative to Gasoline	14-7
14.6	Land-Use Footprints, For Biodiesels Compared to Petrodiesel.....	14-8
14.7	Land-Use Footprints, for Bioethanols Compared to Gasoline	14-9
14.8	Emissions/kWh, Average Gas-Fired Power Plant in Europe	14-13
14.9	Bioethanol Incremental Footprints, Relative to Gasoline	14-14
14.10	Land-Use Footprints, for Biodiesels Compared to Petrodiesel.....	14-16
14.11	Land-Use Footprints, for Bioethanols Compared to Gasoline	14-17
14.12	Emissions/KWH, Average Gas-Fired Power Plant in Europe	14-18